

**AGENDA SOCIOLOGY 929 WEEK 5**  
**Weberian Class Analysis I: Weber & John Scott**  
**October 3, 2006**

---

**1. Command situation**

- What are the gains from adding this as a third dimension? (Rudolfo)
- What is really the difference between the treatment of “command” in Scott and Wright and why does it matter if command is folded into class (Wright) rather than treated as a distinct dimension (Scott)? (Rahul)

**2. Interests vs affect in the formation of solidarity and strata**

- Is this a basic difference with Marx? Does Marx see class formation as coming directly out of interests/exploitation whereas Weber sees these demographic factors as crucial because of the way they impact emotional ties? (Michael)

**3. The power situation/strata/conflict-group triplet: the logic of the connections**

- Are these processes contained within each power source, or interwoven? (Michael)
- Are the three power sources simply the basis of a *descriptive typology* or is this an *explanatory theory*? Does the power situation *constrain* the formation of strata? How? (Elizabeth)

**4. The formation of stratum boundaries**

- Does mobility/demography *define* strata, or does it *explain* strata formation? What is the deep theoretical content of the idea of a stratum?
- What is the relationship between mobility patterns and collective action in the formation of strata-boundaries? Doesn't collective action help explain closure and thus mobility (rather than just vice versa)? (Hsing-Mei)
- What do these demographic factors really explain? Do they make the class concept less coherent to bring them in to the concept itself? (Rahul)

**5. How should we understand the interaction of class and status (in each of the elements and as triplets)?**

- What precisely is the distinction here (class vs. status)? Aren't status groups at least partially constituted by production and not just consumption? (Ann, Assaf)
- How do class and status interact (for example) in processes of school admission? (Sarbani)
- Does status help us explain *class* formation -- i.e. does status affect the relationship between class situation and social class? How does status help explain class consciousness? (Jorge, Charity)

**6. Class consciousness**

- How does the closure of boundaries help us understand consciousness? (Rahul)
- How does status help explain consciousness? (Charity)

**7. Exploitation**

- Why did Weber largely ignore exploitation? Were there advantages to doing this? What would Weber's concept look like if exploitation were added to it? (You-Geon)
- Exploitation: is it a fair criticism that Weber ignores this? Is there any incompatibility with talking about exploitation and rationalization? (Adam)
- Does the Weberian focus on market relations obscure the dependency of capital on labor (via exploitation)? (Joe)

**8. Market relations & class situations**

- Is the labor market the only relevant market for class situation? Is this a contrast between Marxist & Weberian models (Rahul)

**9. Rationalization**

- What precisely does Weber mean by “rationality”? (Adrienne, Sarbani)
- What is the connection between rationality/rationalization and social stability? (Adrienne)
- How does *rationalization of power situations* explain changes in mobility patterns across such situations? (Adam)

**10. Class situation: alternative Weber formulations**

- The commercial class vs property class formulations: how should this be understood? (Fabian)